Tractor

Toward Deep Understanding of Short Intelligence Messages

Stuart C. Shapiro

Department of Computer Science and Engineering Center for Cognitive Science, Center for Multisource Information Fusion University at Buffalo, The State University of New York Buffalo, New York 14260 shapiro@buffalo.edu









Outline

- Acknowledgements
- Introduction
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- From Annotations to Syntactic Propositional Graph
- CBIR
- SNePS 3 and its GUI
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- Statistics
- Performance on Motivational Example
- Summary
- Further Reading

Acknowledgements

Daniel R. Schlegel, James M. Dobler Michael Prentice, Paul Bunter, Michael W. Kandefer

Rakesh Nagi, Kedar Sambhoos, Geoff A. Gross, Greg Tauer

Multidisciplinary University Research Initiative (MURI) Grant (Number W911NF-09-1-0392) for "Unified Research on Network-based Hard/Soft Information Fusion" Issued by the US Army Research Office (ARO) under the program management of Dr. John Lavery.

Tractor I/O

Input: A short English message

- Mostly 1–3 sentences.
- In Counter-insurgency domain.
- Written by human informant or intelligence gatherer.
- Not necessarily "grammatical" English.

Output: Semantic Propositional Graph

- Representing information in the message.
- Nodes for Entities, Events, Actions, Categories, Properties, Property Values, Propositions, ...
- Edges represent non-conceptual relations.

Tractor I/O

Input: A short English message

- Mostly 1–3 sentences.
- In Counter-insurgency domain.
- Written by human informant or intelligence gatherer.
- Not necessarily "grammatical" English.
- Output: Semantic Propositional Graph
 - Representing information in the message.
 - Nodes for Entities, Events, Actions, Categories, Properties, Property Values, Propositions, ...
 - Edges represent non-conceptual relations.

• A single message is written by a single person at a single time.

- Different messages might be written by different people at different times, without the author of one message being aware of the contents of previous messages.
- Therefore,
 - NLP techniques are appropriate for intra-message coreference resolution,
 - inter-message coreference resolution must be based on semantic descriptions of the various entities.
- Tractor must supply those semantic descriptions.

- A single message is written by a single person at a single time.
- Different messages might be written by different people at different times, without the author of one message being aware of the contents of previous messages.

• Therefore,

- NLP techniques are appropriate for intra-message coreference resolution,
- inter-message coreference resolution must be based on semantic descriptions of the various entities.
- Tractor must supply those semantic descriptions.

- A single message is written by a single person at a single time.
- Different messages might be written by different people at different times, without the author of one message being aware of the contents of previous messages.
- Therefore,
 - NLP techniques are appropriate for intra-message coreference resolution,
 - inter-message coreference resolution must be based on semantic descriptions of the various entities.
- Tractor must supply those semantic descriptions.

- A single message is written by a single person at a single time.
- Different messages might be written by different people at different times, without the author of one message being aware of the contents of previous messages.
- Therefore,
 - NLP techniques are appropriate for intra-message coreference resolution,
 - inter-message coreference resolution must be based on semantic descriptions of the various entities.

Tractor must supply those semantic descriptions.

- A single message is written by a single person at a single time.
- Different messages might be written by different people at different times, without the author of one message being aware of the contents of previous messages.
- Therefore,
 - NLP techniques are appropriate for intra-message coreference resolution,
 - inter-message coreference resolution must be based on semantic descriptions of the various entities.
- Tractor must supply those semantic descriptions.

Why Shortness Matters

Since the messages are short, no need to be concerned with

- rhetorical relations
- topic shifts
- etc.

Introduction

Hard+Soft Information Fusion Architecture



S. C. Shapiro (UB)

Tractor

Motivational Example: STEF Messages

- 01/05/07 Increased hostile sentiment being expressed against U.S. troops by many worshippers outside the al-Anbia mosque in Adhamiya.
- 01/06/07 Source said a Sunni youth he knows, Khalid Sattar, has become increasingly vocal in denouncing the U.S. at several mosques in Adhamiya.

Motivational Example: STEF Graphs



[K. Sambhoos, J. Llinas, & E. Little, Graphical Methods for Real-Time Fusion and Estimation with Soft Message Data,

11th International Conference on Information Fusion, 2008.]

Questions:

- Relation between "US" and "United States"?
- What was expressed?
- Who denounced whom?
- Does Source know Khalid Sattar?
- Is Khalid Sattar a Sunni youth?
- What did Source say?
- When did these events occur?

• Short English Message

- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

- Short English Message
- Syntactic Processing
- Human Coreference Editing
- XML Syntactic File of Annotations
- Convert XML to SNePS 3
- SNePS 3 Syntactic Propositional Graph
- Add Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping
- SNePS 3 Semantic Propositional Graph
- Express as GraphML
- Semantic Propositional Graph in GraphML Format

Example Message

1. 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs. – Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.

Character Sequence to English Text

- ANNIE (a Nearly-New Information Extraction System) Tokenizer
- 2 ANNIE Sentence Splitter

Morphology

- ANNIE POS Tagger
- english Stemmer
- Named Entity Recognition
 - List-Based "Gazetteer"
 - 2 ANNIE Rule-Base NE Transducer
- Coreferencers
 - ANNIE OrthoMatcher
 - 2 ANNIE Pronominal Coreferencer
- Stanford Dependency Parser

- Character Sequence to English Text
 - ANNIE (a Nearly-New Information Extraction System) Tokenizer
 - 2 ANNIE Sentence Splitter

2 Morphology

- ANNIE POS Tagger
- 2 English Stemmer
- Named Entity Recognition
 - List-Based "Gazetteer"
 - 2 ANNIE Rule-Base NE Transducer
- Coreferencers
 - ANNIE OrthoMatcher
 - 2 ANNIE Pronominal Coreferencer
- Stanford Dependency Parser

- Character Sequence to English Text
 - ANNIE (a Nearly-New Information Extraction System) Tokenizer
 - 2 ANNIE Sentence Splitter
- 2 Morphology
 - ANNIE POS Tagger
 - 2 English Stemmer
- Named Entity Recognition
 - List-Based "Gazetteer"
 - 2 ANNIE Rule-Base NE Transducer
- Coreferencers
 - ANNIE OrthoMatcher
 - a ANNIE Pronominal Coreferencer
- Stanford Dependency Parser

- Character Sequence to English Text
 - ANNIE (a Nearly-New Information Extraction System) Tokenizer
 - 2 ANNIE Sentence Splitter
- 2 Morphology
 - ANNIE POS Tagger
 - 2 English Stemmer
- Named Entity Recognition
 - List-Based "Gazetteer"
 - 2 ANNIE Rule-Base NE Transducer
- Coreferencers
 - ANNIE OrthoMatcher
 - 2 ANNIE Pronominal Coreferencer
- 5 Stanford Dependency Parser

- Character Sequence to English Text
 - ANNIE (a Nearly-New Information Extraction System) Tokenizer
 - 2 ANNIE Sentence Splitter
- 2 Morphology
 - ANNIE POS Tagger
 - 2 English Stemmer
- Named Entity Recognition
 - List-Based "Gazetteer"
 - 2 ANNIE Rule-Base NE Transducer
- Coreferencers
 - ANNIE OrthoMatcher
 - 2 ANNIE Pronominal Coreferencer
- Stanford Dependency Parser

Results of Tokenizer

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195				
Eile Options Iools Help					
G GATE	Messages 🏽 🐉 Tractor App 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B				
	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference	Editor Text 🔍 🗨			
- 🏁 Tractor App	A.7	1 			
ዮ 👰 Language Resources	 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs. – Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate 	Date			
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and	Dependency			
🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.	JobTitle			
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources		Location			
– 🔧 Snowball Stemmer 🛛 =		Lookup			
– 🍾 Stanford Parser		Person			
– 😹 ANNIE Pronominal Corefer		Sentence			
– 🎎 ANNIE Nominal Coreferen		SpaceToken			
- Aa ANNIE OrthoMatcher		SyntaxTreeNode			
- 🐂 ANNIE NE Transducer		Z Token			
– 🖗 ANNIE POS Tagger		Original markups			
– 🚧 ANNIE Sentence Splitter 👘					
– 🖧 Syncoin Gazetteer					
- 🍾 ANNIE English Tokeniser 💌					
MimeType					
C docNewLineType V LF					
C gate.SourceURL v file:/shared/pi					
1		New			
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor	28 March 2012 13 / 7			

Syntactic Processing

Results of Sentence Splitter

GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195					
Eile Options Iools Help					
💐 😣 🏘 🗰 🏦 🕖					
G GATE	Messages 🐉 Tractor App 💰 bbs1.txt_0001B				
e 🖗 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference	Editor Text 🔍 💌			
– 🏁 Tractor App	A.T				
🕈 🁰 Language Resources	 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs. – Al Saban newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate 	Date Date			
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District	Dependency			
🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 brs.	bobTitle			
🖭 🚧 Processing Resources		Location			
– 🍾 Snowball Stemmer 🛛 =		Lookup			
– 🍾 Stanford Parser		Organization			
– 🎥 ANNIE Pronominal Corefer		✓ Sentence			
- 🎎 ANNIE Nominal Coreferen		SpaceToken			
A ANNIE OrthoMatcher		Split			
- 🗞 ANNIE NE Transducer		Token			
– 🛸 ANNIE POS Tagger		Original markups			
- 🚧 ANNIE Sentence Splitter 🗕					
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer					
🔸 ANNIE English Tokeniser 💌					
C MatchesAnnots ▼ {null=[[599, 6					
C MimeType v text/plain					
C docNewLineType VLF					
gate.sourceUKL + file:/shared/pi					
		New			
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor	28 March 2012 14 /			

Syntactic Processing

Results of POS Tagger & Stemmer

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195				
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp					
💐 🚳 🏘 🌞 🐲 🕋	🔹 😿				
G GATE	Messages 🐉 Tractor App 💰 bbs1.txt_0001B				
🕈 🗱 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Editor Text				
- 🎆 Tractor App					
🕈 👰 Language Resources	1, 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs, # Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy. local presidential candidate	Lookup			
bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District				
- 🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the	SpaceToke			
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources		✓ Token			
– 🍾 Snowball Stemmer		Original m			
– 🛸 ANNIE POS Tagger					
– 🚧 ANNIE Sentence Splitter					
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer					
– 🏌 ANNIE English Tokeniser					
– 🌩 Document Reset PR					
- 🔯 Datastores					
	Type Set Start End Id Fe	atu			
	Token 94 100 1304 {category=NN, kind=word, length=6, orth=lowercase, stem=policy, string=policy	y} •			
	Token 100 101 1305 {category=,, kind=punctuation, length=1, stem=,, string=,}				
	Token 102 107 1307 {category=JJ, kind=word, length=5, orth=lowercase, stem=local, string=local}				
A.T.	Token 108 120 1309 {category=JJ, kind=word, length=12, orth=lowercase, stem=presidential, string=	-pr			
C MatchesAnnots ▼ {null=[]}	Token 121 130 1311 {category=NN, kind=word, length=9, orth=lowercase, stem=candidate, string=c	an			
Adiana Tura a Association	Token 131 135 1313 {category=NNP, kind=word, length=4, orth=upperInitial, stem=azam, string=Aza	am			
C Millierype	Token 136 139 1315 {category=NNP, kind=word, length=3, orth=upperInitial, stem=al-, string=Al-}				
C docNewLineType 🔽 LF	Token 139 144 1316 {category=NNP, kind=word, length=5, orth=upperInitial, stem=azhar, string=Az	hai			
	Token 145 148 1318 {category=VBZ, kind=word, length=3, orth=lowercase, stem=has, string=has}				
gate.sourceukL The:/shared	Token 149 155 1320 {category=VBN, kind=word, length=6, orth=lowercase, stem=call, string=called	}			
C 🗸	Token 156 159 1322 {category=IN, kind=word, length=3, orth=lowercase, stem=for, string=for}				
	Token 160 161 1324 {category=DT, kind=word, length=1, orth=lowercase, stem=a, string=a}				
	73 Annotations (1 selected) Select				
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor 28 Marc	h 2012 15 / 7			

Results of "Gazetteer-Based" Named Entity Recognition

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195	= = *
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp		
💐 🚳 🎍 🌞 🐲 💕	🔹 🕖	
G GATE	Messages 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B 🎆 Tractor App	
🕈 🊧 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Editor Text	
- 🎆 Tractor App		
🛉 👰 Language Resources	 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate 	Lookup
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and	SpaceToken
🖉 🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courtbouse at around 1800 brs.	Original markups
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer		
– 🆒 ANNIE English Tokeniser		
🛛 🔶 Document Reset PR	Type Set Start End Id	
- 🗑 Datastores	Lookup 9 131562 { majorType=year }	
	Lookup 28 36 1563 {majorType=organization, minorType=newspaper}	
	Lookup 31 36 1564 {majorType=person first, minorType=female}	
	Lookup 121 130 1565 { majorType=jobtitle}	
	Lookup 131 144 1566 { majorType=person full}	
	Lookup 136 138 1567 {majorType=person first, minorType=male}	
	Lookup 139 144 1568 {majorType=person first, minorType=male}	
	Lookup 177 203 1569 {majorType=facility, minorType=building}	
	Lookup 184 192 1570 {majorType=loc key, minorType=post}	
	Lookup 205 207 1571 {majorType=person first, minorType=male}	
	Lookup 208 213 1572 {majorType=person first, minorType=male}	
	Lookup 246 250 1573 {majorType=time modifier}	
	Lookup 275 284 1574 {majorType=jobtitle_pl}	
C MatchesAnnots T {null=0}	Lookup 310 315 1575 { majorType=color }	
C MimeType 🔽 text/plain	Lookup 316 319 1576 {majorType=vehicle}	
C docNewLineType 🔽 LF		
C gate.SourceURL 🔻 file:/sharec		
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor	28 March 2012 16 /

Results of Rule-Based Named Entity Recognition


Results of OrthoMatcher

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195	
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp		
🗳 🚳 🄄 🔆 🗰 📓	÷ 🖉	
G GATE	Messages 💰 bbs1.txt_0001B 🎆 Tractor App	
🕈 🌺 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Editor	Text
🚽 🎆 Tractor App		
ዮ 🔯 Language Resources	 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate 	Sets : Derault 🗸
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and	Types : Token 💌 Show
🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.	Co-reference Data 9 Default
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources		Zam Al-Azhar
- Aa ANNIE OrthoMatcher		
- 👯 ANNIE NE Transducer		
– 🛸 ANNIE POS Tagger		
ANNIE Sentence Splitter		
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer		
- 🆒 ANNIE English Tokeniser		
- 🔶 Document Reset PR		
Datastores		
MatchesAnnots Thull-II217		
C MimeType		
C docNewLineType 🔻 LF		
C gate.SourceURL 🔻 file:/sharec		
C I		
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor	28 March 2012 18 / 7

Syntactic Processing

After Pronominal Coreferencer

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195	
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp		
💐 🚳 🔹 🔅 🐲 📓 🗄	▶ 🖉	
G GATE	Messages 🎆 Tractor App 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	
♀ 業 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Edit	tor Text 🔍 💌
– 🐡 Tractor App		Soto - Dofault -
🛉 🏘 Language Resources	 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate 	sets. Default
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and	Types: Token 🔻 Show
💣 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.	Co-reference Data ? Default
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources		🗹 Azam Al-Azhar
– 🔨 Snowball Stemmer 🛛 =		
- 🔨 Stanford Parser		
- 🎨 ANNIE Pronominal Corefe		
- 🎎 ANNIE Nominal Coreferer		
- 👸 ANNIE OrthoMatcher		
- 👯 ANNIE NE Transducer		
— 🛸 ANNIE POS Tagger		
- 🚧 ANNIE Sentence Splitter		
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer		
ANNIE English Tokeniser 💌		
MatchesAppote = fpull=[[599		
C MimeType text/plain		
C docNewLineType VLF		
C gate.SourceURL ▼ file:/shared/		
C V		
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor	28 March 2012 19 /

Syntactic Processing

Result of Dependency Parse

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195			*
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp				
 ** * * 	* 🖉			
G GATE	Messages 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B 🎆 Tractor App			
• 🗰 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Editor Text	Q		-
— 🎆 Tractor App		•	§ 🗸	
🖭 🏘 Language Resources	 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate 		Date	
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and		Dependency	
🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.			
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources			Location	
– 🍾 Snowball Stemmer 🛛 =			Lookup	
– 🍾 Stanford Parser	Type Set Start End Id		Person	
– 😹 ANNIE Pronominal Core	Dependency 31 46 2911 {args=[2622, 2620], kind=nn}		Sentence	
– 🎎 ANNIE Nominal Corefer	Dependency 37 54 2912 {args=[2624, 2622], kind=nsubj} Dependency 47 155 2928 {args=[2624, 2656], kind=ccomp}	-11	SpaceToken	
- 🐴 ANNIE OrthoMatcher	Dependency 55 155 2913 {args=[2656, 2626], kind=complm}		SyntaxTreeNode	
- 👯 ANNIE NE Transducer	Dependency 60 71 2915 {args=[2628, 2630], kind=prep}		Token	
– 🖗 ANNIE POS Tagger	Dependency 63 74 2916 {args=[2630, 2632], kind=prep} Dependency 72 100 2920 {args=[2632, 2640], kind=pob}	-11	Original markups	
ANNIE Sentence Splitte	Dependency 75 100 2917 {args=[2640, 2634], kind=det}			
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer	Dependency 83 100 2919 {args=[2640, 2656], kind=aniou7			
📩 ANNIE English Tokenise 🗸	Dependency 102 144 2921 {args=[2652, 2643], kind=amod} Dependency 108 144 2922 {args=[2652, 2645], kind=amod}	-		
	Dependency 121 144 2923 {args=[2652, 2647], kind=nn}			
C MatchesAnnots ▼ {null=[[277	Dependency 131 144 2924 [args=[2652, 2649], kind=nn}			
C MimeType 👻 text/plain	Dependency 130 144 2925 {args=[2652, 2651], kind=nn} Dependency 139 155 2926 {args=[2656, 2652], kind=nsubj}			
C docNewLineType 🔽 LF	Dependency 145 155 2927 {args=[2656, 2654], kind=aux}	-11		
C gate.SourceURL 🔻 file:/sharec	Dependency 156 169 2931 {args=[2658, 2662], kind=prob]}			
C V	Dependency 100 109 2930 Largs=[2662, 2660], Kind=det} Dependency 162 172 2932 Farse=[2662, 2664], kind=prep}	_		
	Denondenov 170 2026 Face Face Face for a face for the second	•		
1	54 Annotations (0 selected) Select:		81	New
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor		28 March 2012	20 /

Co-reference Editor Initial Chain

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195	
<u>File Options Tools Help</u>		
G GATE	Messages 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	
🕈 🇱 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference E	ditor Text 🔍 🗨
- 🏁 Tractor App		Sete : Default -
🕈 👰 Language Resources	1. 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate	sets. Default
- 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and	Types : Token 🔻 Show
🖉 🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.	P Default
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources		🖌 Azam Al-Azhar
– 🍾 Snowball Stemmer 🛛 =		
– 🍾 Stanford Parser		
– ё ANNIE Pronominal Core		
– 🍀 ANNIE Nominal Corefer		
- Aa ANNIE OrthoMatcher		
- 🎨 ANNIE NE Transducer		
— 🖗 ANNIE POS Tagger		
– 🚧 ANNIE Sentence Splitte		
– 🆧 Syncoin Gazetteer		
ANNIE English Tokenise -		
A.T.		
C MatchesAnnots V {null=[[277		
C MimeType v text/plain		
C docwewLineType V LF		
gate.sourceont		
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor	28 March 2012 21 / 7

Co-reference Editor Adding a Chain

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195	//// = • ×
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp		
💐 😵 🕸 🏶 鬙	🔹 😥	
G GATE	Messages	
ANNIE Nominal Corefer ANNIE NothoMatcher ANNIE NothoMatcher ANNIE Not Transducer ANNIE Sottance Splitte ANNIE Sottance Splitte ANNIE English Tokenise ANNIE English Tokenise MatchesAnnots Annue Splitte Annue Splitte	Add "Second District Courthouse" to [New Chain] ▼ OK Cancel	
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor 28 March 2012	22 /

Co-reference Editor Adding to a Chain

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195	_ = ×
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp		
💐 🚳 😫 🌞 🐲 🚳	🔹 🕖	
G GATE C GAT C GATE C GAT C GAT	Messages & bbs1.bt.0001B & Tractor App Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Editor Text Total 10/2012000, 0700 hrst H & Sabah newspaper reports that in response 16 hrst new government blook, local protect the Second Dated Acom Asbahar has Call of a protect the base Scould bated Acom Asbahar has Call of a protect the base Scould bated courthouse at around 1800 hrs Acom Asbahar has Call of a protect the base Sub arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs Acom Asbahar has Call of a protect the base base base Sub arrive at the Coreference Data 9 Default Ø Second District Courthouse Ø protest OK Cancel	
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor 28 March 2012	23 / 7

Co-reference Editor Final Chains

	GATE Developer 7.0 build 4195
<u>File Options Tools H</u> elp	
💐 🏶 😤 🏶 箇	🔹 💆
G GATE	Messages 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B 🎆 Tractor App
🕈 🌺 Applications	Annotation Sets Annotations List Annotations Stack Co-reference Editor Text Q
- 🎆 Tractor App	Art
🕈 👰 Language Resources	1. 01/31/2010, 0700 hrs Al Sabah newspaper reports that in response to the new government policy, local presidential candidate
– 🕼 bbs1.txt_0001B	Azam Al-Azhar has called for a protest at the Second District Courthouse. Al-Azhar said he would personally attend this protest, and
- 🖉 BombBuster	that local residents should expect to see his black SUV arrive at the courthouse at around 1800 hrs.
🕈 🔆 Processing Resources	Z Azam Al-Azhar
- 📏 Snowball Stemmer 🗧	✓ second district contribuse
- 📏 Stanford Parser	
ANNIE Pronominal Core	
ANNIE Nominal Corefer	
ANNIE OrthoMatcher	
- NE ANNIE NE Transducer	
– 🖗 ANNIE POS Tagger	
ANNIE Sentence Splitte	
- 🎸 Syncoin Gazetteer	
ANNIE English Tokenise	
C MatchesAnnots 🔻 {null=[[277	
C MimeType 🔻 text/plain	
C docNewLineType 🔻 LF	
C gate.SourceURL 🔻 file:/sharec	
S. C. Shapiro (UB)	Tractor 28 March 2012 24 / 7

XML to SNePS 3

```
XML <Annotation Id="510" Type="Token" StartNode="251" EndNode="258">
              <Feature>
                <Name className="java.lang.String">string</Name>
                <Value className="java.lang.String">protest</Value>
              </Feature>
              <Feature>
                <Name className="java.lang.String">category</Name>
                <Value className="java.lang.String">NN</Value>
              </Feature>
              <Feature>
                <Name className="java.lang.String">dependencies</Name>
                <Value className="java.util.ArrayList" itemClassName="java.lang.String">
                       det(569)</Value>
              </Feature>
              <Feature>
                <Name className="java.lang.String">matches</Name>
                <Value className="java.util.ArrayList" itemClassName="java.lang.Integer">
                       482:510</Value>
              </Feature>
              </Annotation>
SNePS 3 (assert `(token-start-pos 510 251))
              (assert '(token-end-pos 510 258))
              (assert '(TextOf |protest| 510))
              (assert '(SyntacticCategoryOf "NN" 510))
              (assert '(det 510 569))
              (assert '(Equiv (setof 482 510)))
```

xml2sneps3

Besides translation, xml2sneps3

- combines annotations that cover same substring into one token,
- adjusts message times to GMT,
- adjusts message dates as necessary given time change,
- converts message dates to ISO format.

CBIR

Adding Contextually Relevant Background/Ontological Information

For each noun in the graph

- Finds the Cyc concept from ResearchCyc
- Loads the ontology above it in OpenCyc into the graph

SNePS 3

SNePS 3 is the latest member of the SNePS Family of KRR systems.

It is still being implemented.

The SNePS 3 KB can be thought of as simultaneously being:

- Logic based,
- Frame based, and
- Graph based.

We have created a user interface which uses all three:

- Assertions and queries of a KB are handled using logic or frames.
- Visualization and inspection is done using propositional graphs.

SNePS 3 GUI



The SNePS 3 KB is a set of logical expressions:

- Atomic terms
 - Individual constants denoting entities in domain including some relations
- Arbitrary and indefinite terms [Shapiro, KR2004]
- Functional terms including
 - terms denoting atomic propositions
 - terms denoting non-atomic propositions
- Use CLIF syntax.

Every logical expression is a term.

Allows propositions about propositions without leaving First-Order. Internal name of functional terms: wfti [!]

The SNePS 3 KB is a set of logical expressions:

- Atomic terms
 - Individual constants denoting entities in domain including some relations
- Arbitrary and indefinite terms [Shapiro, KR2004]
- Functional terms including
 - terms denoting atomic propositions
 - terms denoting non-atomic propositions
- Use CLIF syntax.

Every logical expression is a term.

Allows propositions about propositions without leaving First-Order. Internal name of functional terms: $wf \pm i$ [1]

The SNePS 3 KB is a set of logical expressions:

- Atomic terms
 - Individual constants denoting entities in domain including some relations
- Arbitrary and indefinite terms [Shapiro, KR2004]
- Functional terms including
 - terms denoting atomic propositions
 - terms denoting non-atomic propositions

Use CLIF syntax.

Every logical expression is a term.

Allows propositions about propositions without leaving First-Order. Internal name of functional terms: wfti [!]

The SNePS 3 KB is a set of logical expressions:

- Atomic terms
 - Individual constants denoting entities in domain including some relations
- Arbitrary and indefinite terms [Shapiro, KR2004]
- Functional terms including
 - terms denoting atomic propositions
 - terms denoting non-atomic propositions

Use CLIF syntax.

Every logical expression is a term.

Allows propositions about propositions without leaving First-Order.

The SNePS 3 KB is a set of logical expressions:

- Atomic terms
 - Individual constants denoting entities in domain including some relations
- Arbitrary and indefinite terms [Shapiro, KR2004]
- Functional terms including
 - terms denoting atomic propositions
 - terms denoting non-atomic propositions

Use CLIF syntax.

Every logical expression is a term.

Allows propositions about propositions without leaving First-Order.

Internal name of functional terms: wft*i* [!] for "well-formed term".

The SNePS 3 KB is a set of logical expressions:

- Atomic terms
 - Individual constants denoting entities in domain including some relations
- Arbitrary and indefinite terms [Shapiro, KR2004]
- Functional terms including
 - terms denoting atomic propositions
 - terms denoting non-atomic propositions
- Use CLIF syntax.

Every logical expression is a term.

Allows propositions about propositions without leaving First-Order. Internal name of functional terms: wfti [!] for "well-formed term".

 Based on "The Case for Case" [Fillmore, 1968] and The Berkeley FrameNet Project

- Frame
 - schematic representation of a situation with a set of participants and conceptual roles.
- Eliminates syntactic differences.
- E.g.
 - Sufian called Ziyad.
 - Ziyad was called by Sufian.
 - a call from Sufian to Ziyad
- We will use "caseframe" for their "frame"
- and use "frame" for an instantiated caseframe.

 Based on "The Case for Case" [Fillmore, 1968] and The Berkeley FrameNet Project

- Frame
 - schematic representation of a situation with a set of participants and conceptual roles.
- Eliminates syntactic differences.
- E.g.
 - Sufian called Ziyad.
 - Ziyad was called by Sufian.
 - a call from Sufian to Ziyad
- We will use "caseframe" for their "frame"
- and use "frame" for an instantiated caseframe.

 Based on "The Case for Case" [Fillmore, 1968] and The Berkeley FrameNet Project

- Frame
 - schematic representation of a situation with a set of participants and conceptual roles.
- Eliminates syntactic differences.
- E.g.
 - Sufian called Ziyad.
 - Ziyad was called by Sufian.
 - a call from Sufian to Ziyad
- We will use "caseframe" for their "frame"
- and use "frame" for an instantiated caseframe.

 Based on "The Case for Case" [Fillmore, 1968] and The Berkeley FrameNet Project

- Frame
 - schematic representation of a situation with a set of participants and conceptual roles.
- Eliminates syntactic differences.
- E.g.
 - Sufian called Ziyad.
 - Ziyad was called by Sufian.
 - a call from Sufian to Ziyad
- We will use "caseframe" for their "frame"
- and use "frame" for an instantiated caseframe.

Components of Caseframes

Definition

A caseframe has

- A name
- A sort
- An ordered list of slots
- ...

Slots

Slots are defined globally independently of the caseframes that use them.

Definition

- A slot has
 - A name
 - Minimum and maximum number of fillers
 - The sort of its fillers

• ...

Examples of Caseframes

Example

Isa is a caseframe of type Proposition with slots member and class.

Example

Call is a caseframe of type Proposition with slots Communicator, Addressee, and Communication.

Frames vs. Logical Terms

- A frame is an instance of a caseframe.
- The logical term (F x₁,..., x_n) is represented by an instance of the caseframe named F whose slots, s₁,..., s_n are filled by the representations of x₁,..., x_n, respectively.

Frames vs. Logical Terms: Example

creates an instance of the Call caseframe

whose Communicator slot contains the filler Sufian,

whose Addressee slot contains Ziyad,

and whose Communication slot

contains "My brother sends greetings".

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wft*i*[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

Directed Acyclic Graph

• Every term is a node.

- Individual constants
- Functional terms (frames)
- Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wft*i*[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wfti[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wfti[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wft*i*[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wft*i*[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wft*i*[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wfti[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wfti[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers
Propositional Graphs

A way of visualizing and traversing the frames.

- Directed Acyclic Graph
- Every term is a node.
 - Individual constants
 - Functional terms (frames)
 - Proposition-denoting functional terms
- Node ID is
 - symbol
 - frame name (wfti[!])

Edges drawn

from the node corresponding to the frame, to the nodes corresponding to the slot fillers

Edges labeled by slot names

Example Propositional Graph



"Sufian, a person in Adhamiya, called Ziyad, a person who, according to Ahmed, is in Ramadi, saying 'My brother sends greetings.'"

0 (honiro	
ъ. с	J. ວ	napiro (UD.

• Visualized graph is for human comprehension.

• Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.

• Usefulness of wft nodes:

- Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
- Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
- Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

- Visualized graph is for human comprehension.
- Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.
- Usefulness of wft nodes:
 - Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
 - Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
 - Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

- Visualized graph is for human comprehension.
- Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.

• Usefulness of wft nodes:

- Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
- Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
- Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

- Visualized graph is for human comprehension.
- Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.
- Usefulness of wft nodes:
 - Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
 - Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
 - Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

- Visualized graph is for human comprehension.
- Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.
- Usefulness of wft nodes:
 - Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
 - Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
 - Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

- Visualized graph is for human comprehension.
- Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.
- Usefulness of wft nodes:
 - Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
 - Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
 - Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

- Visualized graph is for human comprehension.
- Visualized graph need not be isomorphic to implementation of KB.
- Usefulness of wft nodes:
 - Functional term with more than two arguments (slots).
 - Functional term with more than one filler in a slot.
 - Functional term shown as argument of another (filler in a slot).
- Can show a binary relation with no arc coming into it as a labeled arc ("collapsed arc").

• Slots in a frame are ordered.

- Order of slots = order of arguments of functional term.
- Draw collapsed arc from first argument to second argument.
- Name of caseframe = function symbol.
- Label collapsed arc with function symbol.
- Different style of arrow head so user knows it's a collapsed arc.

- Slots in a frame are ordered.
- Order of slots = order of arguments of functional term.
- Draw collapsed arc from first argument to second argument.
- Name of caseframe = function symbol.
- Label collapsed arc with function symbol.
- Different style of arrow head so user knows it's a collapsed arc.

- Slots in a frame are ordered.
- Order of slots = order of arguments of functional term.
- Draw collapsed arc from first argument to second argument.
- Name of caseframe = function symbol.
- Label collapsed arc with function symbol.
- Different style of arrow head so user knows it's a collapsed arc.

- Slots in a frame are ordered.
- Order of slots = order of arguments of functional term.
- Draw collapsed arc from first argument to second argument.
- Name of caseframe = function symbol.
- Label collapsed arc with function symbol.
- Different style of arrow head so user knows it's a collapsed arc.

- Slots in a frame are ordered.
- Order of slots = order of arguments of functional term.
- Draw collapsed arc from first argument to second argument.
- Name of caseframe = function symbol.
- Label collapsed arc with function symbol.
- Different style of arrow head so user knows it's a collapsed arc.

- Slots in a frame are ordered.
- Order of slots = order of arguments of functional term.
- Draw collapsed arc from first argument to second argument.
- Name of caseframe = function symbol.
- Label collapsed arc with function symbol.
- Different style of arrow head so user knows it's a collapsed arc.

Example of Collapsed Graph: Before

The uncollapsed version of Suifian calling Ziyad example:



Example of Collapsed Graph: After

The collapsed version of Suifian calling Ziyad example:



Syntax-Semantics Mapping

SNePS 3 Syntactic Graph Visualized (Uncollapsed)



Syntax-Semantics Mapping

SNePS 3 Syntactic Graph Visualized (Collapsed)



Mapping Rule: properNounToName



Mapping Rule: nounPhraseToInstance



Mapping Rule: atLocation



Mapping Rule: colorProperty



Mapping Rule: distribVerbOverConj



Mapping Rule: distribSubjOverXcomp



Another Example

7. 01/31/2010, 1817 hrs. – Blue team reports that a medium height man with dark hair

just entered a blue car by the Second District Courthouse. The man was wearing a tan jacket. They are not sure where he came from.

Mapping Rules: nounPhraseToInstance; madeOfSubstance; colorProperty; hasDimensionValue; withTypicalPart



CBIR Productivity

Over the 7 messages of the Bomber Buster data set Noun types looked up: 80 Noun tokens: 165 Assertions added to graphs: 11,860

Mapping Rule Usage

Rule	bbs1	bbs2	bbs3	bbs4	bbs5	bbs6	bbs7	Total
addRelevantOntology	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	8
substringCoreference	10	4	12	2	6	6	6	46
distribModOverConj	1	0	1	1	1	0	0	4
properNounToName	13	7	15	3	6	4	4	52
nounPhraseToInstance	5	9	4	12	4	2	5	41
madeOfSubstance	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
atLocation	1	0	0	0	1	1	0	3
modLocation	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	1
colorProperty	1	2	2	3	2	0	3	13
hasDimensionValue	0	1	0	0	0	0	1	2
withTypicalPart	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
distribVerbOverConj	1	0	1	0	1	0	0	3
passiveToActive	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
distribSubjOverXcomp	2	0	0	1	0	0	0	3
isalsEquiv	0	2	0	1	0	0	0	3
prepToRelation	1	3	0	3	0	0	0	7
removeRedundantStems	56	59	37	73	28	17	40	310
removeTextWhenIsa	6	12	4	13	4	2	5	46
removeTextWhenMadeOf	0	0	0	0	0	0	1	1
Total	98	101	77	113	54	33	69	545

Timings

Average running time per message Over the 7 messages of the Bomber Buster data set On a Core i7 2600K @ 3.4ghz, with 16GB RAM

GATE (without human coreference editing):2.642 secsxml2sneps3:0.978 secsPropositionalizer (without CBIR):0.596 secsPropositionalizer (with CBIR):74.547 secs

(Significant start-up time, so steady-state is faster.)

Motivational Example: STEF Messages

- 01/05/07 Increased hostile sentiment being expressed against U.S. troops by many worshippers outside the al-Anbia mosque in Adhamiya.
- 01/06/07 Source said a Sunni youth he knows, Khalid Sattar, has become increasingly vocal in denouncing the U.S. at several mosques in Adhamiya.

Motivational Example: STEF Graphs



[K. Sambhoos, J. Llinas, & E. Little, Graphical Methods for Real-Time Fusion and Estimation with Soft Message Data, 11th

International Conference on Information Fusion, 2008.]

Questions:

- Relation between "US" and "United States"?
- What was expressed?
- Who denounced whom?
- Does Source know Khalid Sattar?
- Is Khalid Sattar a Sunni youth?
- What did Source say?
- When did these events occur?

Tractor on STEF001



Tractor on STEF002



STEF001: "US"



STEF002: "US"


STEF001: What was Expressed?



STEF002: Who denounced whom?



STEF002: Does Source know Khalid Sattar?



STEF002: Is Khalid Sattar a Sunni youth?



STEF002: What did Source say?



STEF001: When did these events occur?



STEF002: When did these events occur?



• Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".

- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.

Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

- Short English message, not necessarily "grammatical".
- Syntactic processing within GATE.
- Named Entity Recognition, List-Based and Rule-Based.
- Automatic Coreferencers.
- Human Coreference Editing.
- Dependency Parser.
- Syntactic Propositional Graph: Syntactic Relations.
- Syntax-Semantics Mapping Rules.
- Semantic Propositional Graph reflects information in message.

Further Reading

- Michael Prentice, Michael Kandefer, & Stuart C. Shapiro, Tractor: A Framework for Soft Information Fusion, *Proceedings of the 13th International Conference on Information Fusion (Fusion 2010)*, 2010, Th3.2.2, 8 pages, unpaginated.
- Michael Prentice and Stuart C. Shapiro, Using Propositional Graphs for Soft Information Fusion, *Proceedings of the 14th International Conference on Information Fusion (Fusion 2011)*, 2011, 522–528.
- Daniel R. Schlegel and Stuart C. Shapiro, Visually Interacting with a Knowledge Base Using Frames, Logic, and Propositional Graphs. In M. Croitoru, S. Rudolph, N. Wilson, J. Howse, and O. Corby, Eds., *Graph Structures for Knowledge Representation and Reasoning, Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence 7205*, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 2012, in press.